

1.10.1. Unstated Premise Problems

A. Put each of the following arguments into **standard form**, and describe a **validity counterexample** for the argument as stated. Then add an **unstated premise** that would block that validity counterexample.

1. Since Kitty hates gothic architecture, she wouldn't like the Duomo di Milano.

2. Lucretia must be a ghost hunter, since only ghost hunters wear spirit goggles.

3. Virgins don't lie, so Maureen must not be lying.¹

4. Pittsburgh isn't the capital of Pennsylvania. So the Pennsylvania state house must not be in Pittsburgh.

5. Given that Jack is a surfer, he must not be an astronaut.

6. Speculative Astronomy not being a humanities course, it will not fulfill Area C of the Gen Ed requirement.

7. **Neko**: Do you agree with Suki's view?

Rex: I would have to understand Suki's view in order to agree with it; so no, I don't agree with her view.

8. **Kitty**: Is Jake going on the training mission?

Doctor Slim: Going on the training mission requires getting up early every day for tough, extensive exercise programs. Which means there's no chance of Jake going on the training mission.

¹ Adapted from **Happy Days** Season 2, Episode 13 ("*Fonzie's Getting Married*"). See also 7.9.1. Problem 1.

B. For each of the following arguments (with unstated premise added in brackets) **state which principle is violated** by adding that unspoken premise to the argument. *(In some cases more than one principle may be violated; in those case mention one of the principles violated.)*

- 1. Validity**
- 2. Simplicity**
- 3. No Useless Sentences**

1) “If Dr. Slim’s not at the Bellagio, then he’s at the Luxor. So Dr. Slim must be at the Luxor.”

1. If Dr. Slim’s not at the Bellagio, then he’s at the Luxor.
- [2. Dr. Slim got a special deal for the Luxor, but not for the Bellagio.**
- [3. Dr. Slim will stay where he can get a special deal.]**

∴ Dr. Slim [is] at the Luxor.

2) “Suki isn’t an astronaut, since she hasn’t had flight training.”

1. [Suki] hasn’t had flight training.
- [2. Suki thinks flight training sounds interesting.]**

∴ Suki isn’t an astronaut.

3) “Trixie’s at work unless she’s with Elvis. But if she were at work her car would be gone. So she must be with Elvis.”

1. Trixie’s at work unless she’s with Elvis.
2. If she were at work, her car would be gone.
- [3. Trixie isn’t at work.]**

∴ She [is] with Elvis.

C. For each of the problems in (B), **replace** the incorrect unspoken premise(s) given with the **correct unspoken premise(s)**.

D. For each of the following arguments, describe a **validity counterexample** for the argument as stated. Then add an **unstated premise** that would block that validity counterexample.

1)

1. Nobody is both a surfer and an astronaut.
2. (But) Jack would only be practicing his carving and cutbacks if he's a surfer.

∴ Jack isn't an astronaut.

2a)

1. If Elvis isn't back then he must still be in Santee.
2. If he were back, his car would in the driveway.

∴ Elvis must still be in Santee.

2b) For the argument in (2a), what's wrong with proposing the following sentence as the missing premise?

[3B. Elvis isn't back.]

(That is: what principle would be violated by having this sentence as the unstated premise?)

E. For each of the following arguments, make an **argument map**, and **add** any **unstated premises**.

1. Dr. Slim isn't an attorney, since all attorneys have passed the bar exam. But a paralegal who isn't an attorney must have ABA certification. So Dr. Slim's neither an attorney nor a paralegal.
2. Nobody on our team can access the crime reports, since that requires Level 4 clearance. But the only way we can complete the threat analysis on time without crime reports is to find someone who can pull up the quarterly summaries for us. So without help from a field agent, the threat analysis will be late.
3. Can Neko and Rex agree on any restaurant for dinner? We know Neko won't eat ngau lam or oxtail soup since she's currently on an all-fish diet; so she won't agree to Ngau & Zen. And since Dumpling Depot doesn't make cha siu bao, Rex won't eat there. That leaves Spicy City as the only place they'll both to go.
4. Jack is a short-haired cat, so he's not a Birman. But he's neither a tabby nor a calico, given his seal-point markings. The only other options being that he's a Siamese or Burmese, clearly Jack must be one of those.
5. Don't tell me William James was the best logician of the 19th century. After all, James thought logic could be summed up in the 'Barbara' form of syllogism, so he was unfamiliar with the calculus of relations. Moreover, both Frege and Peirce understood variable-binding, so they could apply logic to mathematics – something any good logician should be able to do.
6. I'm surprised to hear people still asking whether wakalixes are both prangiline and tamoral. Look, wakalixes are obviously prangiline, since they're zhaqti. But they could only be tamoral if they're either baskish or lomsical. So clearly wakalixes are prangiline, but they're not tamoral.